

ALL-CONFERENCE VOTING SURVEY OF DIII COMMISSIONERS

August 2008

1. Does your conference use open balloting for all-conference voting?

No: 13

Yes: 6

If yes, what sports?

Comments:

- o Yes, all sports.
- o No for all sports except men's hockey.
- o No, in most of our sports, we use secret ballots. I think of one or two at most that use open voting – if that's what you are asking about.
- o Yes, all sports (for the first time last year).
- o No, we tried it one year for men's lacrosse. The coaches had to give their votes, which I posted on a board for all to see. The problem arose when the last coach who was voting realized that he could impact the outcome of the team with his vote. Men's lacrosse still has an in-person meeting, but the votes are secret.
- o Yes, baseball, football, soccer and volleyball discuss the nominees at a meeting and make their selections. M Basketball makes their selections through a conference call. W Basketball uses individual ballots and we tally points (1st team-3pts, 2nd team-2pts...3rd team/HM-1pts). Tennis and Softball emails commissioner and points are tallied.
- o We are in the process of instituting this for the 2008-09 academic year.
- o No, except in football and baseball. Softball will move in this direction in 2009.
- o No, except... Baseball and football are the only sports where the coaches know who the others voted for because they do it by verbal vote either in front of each other (football) or by tele-conference (baseball).
- o Soccer (m/w), Volleyball, Basketball (m/w), Tennis (m/w), Baseball and Softball.
- o Yes, all sports that have a vote (M&W BB, M&W Soccer, Football, Volleyball, Baseball, Softball).

If yes, have there been any negative impacts when using an open ballot?

Comments:

- o No
- o Unknown
- o Not yet, because no one has asked to see the voting (we would only share the results if requested by the ad, not the coach).
- o I think the open balloting as well as the in-person meeting has led to some hard feelings from time-to-time. All of the coaches felt that if they had an opportunity to speak, that it would improve their chances of getting more players on the all-conference team. Well, not everyone is going to get more players.
- o From what I've heard the only negative might be a young coach that's in the meeting for the first few times who might be compelled to vote for the coach that makes the most compelling argument (or is a bully) because they want to avoid conflict with the emotional individual. Other than that it seems like it's pretty efficient.
- o 2007-08 was the first year of open ballots. We require signatures of the head coach and AD on nomination and voting ballots. Ballots are open for examination by written request to the Commissioner for a seven-day window following release of the awards. We had fewer incidences of "low-balling" to protect one's own players than in the past, and had only three coaches request to see ballots.
- o None that I've heard in my first year - we were all over the place w/ these types of things so I just

General Comments:

- o We changed this last year when I came on board. It is all done by secret ballot. The coaches used to hash it out at an in-person meeting, but the AD's felt as if we were rewarding the coaches that argued/debated more effectively than rewarding student-athletes who performed best.

2. When voting for all-conference teams, do you assign a point value to a selection such as: first team all-conference vote receives 5 points, second team all-conference vote receives 3 points, and third team all-conference receives 1 point?

o Yes: 13

o No: 2

If you assign a point value, what is your structure (3,2,1 or 5,3,1 or 10,5,1 or top 15 receiving points 15 to 1 or other)?

- 10-5-1: 1
- 5-3-1: 2
- 3-2-1: 1
- Our point value is based on the number of positions you can vote for then reversed. For example if you can vote for three and your number one choice gets three points.
- It depends upon the number of teams that sponsor that sport. Usually the 1st place vote is an extra point higher.
- We do assign a point value. For example in basketball, the coaches vote for 10 players on a weighted ballot with the top choice getting 10 points, second choice 9 points, etc. (I have attached a copy of the ballot).
- When tallying our all-conference teams (first and second team only), points are given in an inverse to the number of total positions. For example, in Basketball where all-conference teams are not named by position, coaches must vote for 10 players, and rank them 1-10. The player ranked #1 receives 10 points, while the player ranked 10th receives 1 point. Once the votes have all been cast, the totals are calculated for each student-athlete receiving votes. The 5 student-athletes receiving the highest number of points are named to the 1st Team. The next 5 are named to the 2nd Team. And student-athlete that receives at least two votes is receives an Honorable Mention. In sports where the teams are named by position, it is essentially the same process. For example, in Soccer, the coaches must vote for four backs. The player ranked first receives 4 points, etc. . .
- With ballots, vote for two complete teams - 10 in basketball, 12 in volleyball, 22 in soccer, etc.. Scoring is in declining order - E.g. 12 points for #1 in volleyball, 11 for #2...1 point for #12. Highest point total is MVP.
- We rank order the selections. If there are 22 spots, coaches vote 22 down to 1 and don't vote for their own S-As.
- Voters rank the required number of nominees with "1" signifying the top person. Those rankings are converted to a point-value where the #1 rank equals the highest possible number of points. On the 10-player basketball ballot, the #1 ranked player receives 10 points, #2 receives 9 points, etc. Points are totaled and placed on awards teams as dictated by sport policies.
- 1 for 1st, 2 for 2nd, 3 for HM - lowest point total gets first, etc.

If you use different point structures for different sports, please describe each separately.

General Comments:

- Different for Each Sport - It's different mainly because of the number of students on each team (11 for soccer, 9 for baseball / softball, 6 for volleyball and 5 for basketball; therefore the high number (point value) may be the same (ex. 25), but the rest are spread accordingly.
- Each sport decides how it wants to choose all-conference, so we use different methods of selection. Some sports do use point totals for voting.
 - Field Hockey - Coaches vote for 11 players (10 field players + a goalkeeper) - no points assigned.
 - Football - Coaches vote for six offensive linemen, three/four receivers (could include tight end), three/four offensive backs, one quarterback, five defensive linemen, four linebackers, five defensive backs, one place-kicker, one punter. Those that are nominated but don't make first team automatically make second team - no points assigned in the voting process.
 - Soccer - First team selections receive 3 points, second team selections receive 2 points, and third team selections receive 1 point in the process to determine places on the team.
 - Volleyball - Coaches vote for 21 players to fill out 3 teams (7 per team) with a coaches top vote getting 21 points on down to the 21st vote getting 1 point. Top 7 point totals are first team, next 7 are second and next 7 are third. Top vote getter is player of the year.
 - Basketball - Coaches vote for 15 players to fill out 3 teams (5 per team) with a coaches top vote getting 15 points on down to the 15th vote getting 1 point. Top 5 point totals are first team, next 5 are second and next 5 are third. Top vote getter is player of the year.
 - Baseball - Coaches vote for eight infielders (2 first basemen, 2 second baseman, 2 shortstops, 2 third basemen), six outfielders, two designated hitters, two catchers and five pitchers for the All-SCAC first team - no points assigned. Those not selected First Team All-SCAC but get votes are honorable mention.
 - Softball - Top vote getters at each position are first team all-SCAC...next vote getters at each position are second team all-SCAC.
 - Tennis - Coaches vote for 10 players to fill out one team with the top choice getting 10 points on down to the 10th choice getting one vote. Top 10 vote getters are All-SCAC with overall top vote getter being Player of the Year.
- We use 10-5-1 for all team except men's and women's basketball who use declining order of points (i.e. 15 points for #1, 14 points for #2,, 1 point for #15).

- Based on the number of participants on a team in their sport, each coach is to rank a team (for example, in basketball, a coach would rank 5 player, in soccer, eleven player, etc.).
- Men's and Women's Basketball – Get to rank top ten players each and points are assigned 10 to 1 and then tallied. For men top five are 1st team, second five are 2nd team, third five are Honorable mention. Women name top ten point earners 1st team and next five second team. Men's Soccer awards points starting with 6,5,4 . . . , Women's Soccer awards points starting with 20 through 1, Softball starts with 10 points and works down, Volleyball starts with 12 points and works down.

General Comments:

- I've been told that some sports used to rank, but there was too much room to manipulate the system.
- We do not assign any points for votes. We simply take the people with the most votes and plug them into the respective team.

3. How do you break ties in all-conference voting? i.e., if three players are tied for the last slot on the first team, how do you break that tie?

- Yes: 10
- No: 9

General Comments:

- We leave it as a tie and produce an additional certificate (minimal cost).
- Coaches vote - we have in-person meetings, if they cannot break the tie, the conference office does.
- If there is a tie for the remaining spot, all student-athletes make the team they are tied for.
- Ties are broken looking at statistics. If all is equal a spot may be added.
- If there is a tie in voting, we simply vote using only the players involved in the ties. Coaches have the authority to determine how to break any ties...with almost all of them using a tie-breaking vote.
- We have a run-off vote; if still tied, remains a tie (and we have one extra player on that particular team; we do not subtract from the next lowest team)
- If players are tied for the last spot, all make that particular team ... 1st or 2nd.
- We do NOT break the ties.....we would just have more members on the first team.
- We don't break ties at a position. If three players tie for the last spot on first team, then those three would all be first team and the next person on the list would be second team.
- Coaches are asked to rank each of their nominees. If there is a tie in the voting, the tie is broken by looking at the player rankings. The player ranked higher by his/her coach gets the spot.
- If we have a tie for the final position on a team, the tie stands.
- The tie-breaker is the total whoever received the most number of #1 votes. If neither student-athlete received any, then we move to #2, etc. until the tie is broken.
- We take out the ballots from the coaches of the players involved to see if that breaks the tie. If not, we do a re-vote on those players only. Some sports specify ties are broken by going with the player from the team that finished higher. All ties must be broken - no co-MVPs, etc.
- We break ties using a combination of items: statistics, votes for 1st team vs. 2nd team vs. no votes, and team's overall finish. Ties are broken with AD/chair of the sport group and commissioner.
- Ties are not broken for all conference teams. For player of the year, coach of the year, or rookie of the year, the person's rank is used to break ties. If more than two persons are still tied, a tie-breaking vote is conducted.
- We revote – only the tied players.
- Most sports mentioned above break ties by naming all ties all-conference. One sport creates a new ballot to break tie.
- We do not break ties for the teams. If two or more are tied for the fifth spot, all of those players are on that team.
- Me, the liaison administrator, and the Conference SID decide.

4. When nominating players for all-conference selections, do you use conference stats only for each player or their total season statistics including all games?

- Conference Only: 5
- Overall: 3
- Both Conference and Overall: 9

If you use conference stats only, have you had any issues with this?

General Comments:

- We use conference only because of the disparity of non-conference opponents that teams play. Still, there are some that claim some people still run up numbers on the weaker teams in the conference more than others. All in all, it seems to work well (my previous conference – D-II – used to provide both sets, overall and conference-only). Less work on our end when there's only one set of numbers to produce.
- No issues. It keeps everyone at an even level.
- We primarily use conference only stats. Some coaches groups look at overall stats but 98% of our coaches use only conference stats...since that's what we are voting on...all-conference honors. We've never had any issues with this approach.
- This is an on-going debate with the coaches and we have come to realize that it can not be dictated and is subjective from coach to coach. In addition, statistics alone are not a true measure of the s/a's consideration for all-conference. There are other intangibles that do not show up in statistical categories ... leadership, defense, ability to make your teammates & team better, etc.
- It depends on the sport. Some sports we provide both sets of statistics (conf. only and overall) and others use conference only. In those that use conference only, I'm not 100% sure that is what the coaches really do use. If I had my personal choice we would provide statistics for overall games and that would be it.
- We use overall stats to vote, but do allow coaches to also submit conference-only stats if they so desire. We have been flexible in most sports in that I ask for certain information to be provided for the nomination process, but then coaches/SIDs have the flexibility to put more on the nomination if they so choose. I was having problems with people wanting to put more than what I was putting on the standard nomination form, so I opened it up to letting them put what they wanted as long as the standard information was also used.
- We ran into a problem with volleyball a few years back when one of the teams was much stronger than the rest of the teams. As a result, the team (Stevens) used to play a lot of reserve players in these matches. Sometimes starters only played one game, therefore, the statistics for the starters may not have been as strong as some of the other players in the conference.
- Some sports use conf stats only, some use overall only.
- We use conference and overall stats, separated for easy comparison.
- We provide links on the ballot to both cumulative and conference-only stats.
- We use overall statistics only.
- Overall – but they can be sorted by conference stats – coaches tend to emphasize conference stats more when they vote, but we don't require any specific evaluation of stats in nomination or voting – leave it to coach discretion.
- Varies.
- Most sports only allow conference stats for primary consideration – some sports will allow overall stats as secondary info.
- We permit use of both overall and conference statistics for voting -- all are available on the conference website. We used to copy-and-paste both sets of stats into a nominee information document, but no longer do that since coaches have all types of data available to them online (and they use that throughout the year for stats). Since I came to the conference office Jan 2002, I have always included both sets of stats on postseason awards ballots/information. The more information available to coaches the better.
- We present both but do not base All-NWC on conference contests only.

General Comments:

- The conference holds coaches conference calls for awards in Football and Softball only. On the calls, we go through the nominees by position with coaches permitted to make brief comments (no stats, please!) and add/delete/re-position players. After the call, ballots may be sent. Volleyball nominations include a very brief (1-3 sentence) statement about each player. In all three sports, I am not convinced the call is all that useful -- I think most coaches already know who they are voting and where they'll be ranked before we begin. It may help some who are unsure, however.